



Our ref.: LES/J2018-05/CS/L034
Date : 18 April 2019

Civil Engineering and Development Department

East Development Office
East Division 2
Suite 1213,
Chinachem Golden Plaza,
77 Mody Road,
Tsim Sha Tsui East, Kowloon

Attn: Mr. Henry Lu

Dear Mr. Lu

**Service Contract No. EDO/01/2017
ENVIRONMENTAL TEAM FOR
Development of Anderson Road Quarry Site –
Road Improvement Works**

Submission of Updated Justification for Transplanting 2 nos. *Aquilaria sinensis* Trees

We hereby submit the captioned report which certified by the ET Leader and verified by IEC in accordance with Condition 2.14b and 2.15 of EP-513/2016 for your perusal and processing.

Should you have any queries, please contact the undersigned at 6178 3179.

Yours faithfully,
For and On Behalf Of
Lam Environmental Services Limited

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Sam Lam".

Sam LAM
Environmental Team Leader

Encl.

c.c. AECOM
ANewR Consulting Limited

Mr. Dennis Leung
Mr. Adi Lee



Civil Engineering and Development Department
New Territories East Development Office
Suite 1213 Chinachem Golden Plaza
77 Mody Road
Tsim Sha Tsui East
Kowloon

Your reference:

Our reference: HKCEDD12/50/105705

Date: 17 April 2019

Attention: Mr Leung Siu Kau, Kelvin

BY POST

Dear Sirs

Agreement No. EDO/04/2017
Independent Environmental Checker (IEC) for Development of Anderson Road Quarry Site
– Road Improvement Works
Transplantation Proposal – Updated Justification for Transplanting 2 Nos. *Aquilaria Sinensis* Trees

We refer to the emails on 8, 14 and 16 April 2019 from Environmental Team, Lam Environmental Services Limited attaching a Transplantation Proposal – Updated Justification for Transplanting 2 Nos. *Aquilaria Sinensis* Trees for the captioned project.

We have no further comment and hereby verify the abovementioned Transplantation Proposal – Updated Justification for Transplanting 2 Nos. *Aquilaria Sinensis* Trees in accordance with Clause 2.14b & 2.15 of the Environmental Permit no. EP-513/2016.

Should you have any queries, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned or our Ms Angie Chan on 2618 2831.

Yours faithfully
ANewR CONSULTING LIMITED

Adi Lee
Independent Environmental Checker

LYMA/CWA/lhnh

cc AECOM head office – Mr Ivan Tsang (email: ivan.tsang@aecom.com)
AECOM – Mr Brad C W Chan (email: c3-srec4@arqaecom.com)
Lam Environmental Services Limited – Mr Sam Lam (email: kclam@lamenviro.com)



CONTRACT NO: NE/2017/03

**DEVELOPMENT OF
ANDERSON ROAD QUARRY SITE -
ROAD IMPROVEMENT WORKS**

**TRANSPLANTATION PROPOSAL –
UPDATED JUSTIFICATION FOR TRANSPLANTING 2 NOS. *AQUILARIA SINENSIS* TREES**

CLIENTS:

Civil Engineering and Development Department

PREPARED BY:

Jay WAN
Qualified Ecologist

CERTIFIED BY:

Sam LAM
Environmental Team Leader

Lam Environmental Services Limited

11/F Centre Point
181-185 Gloucester Road
Wanchai, H.K.

Telephone: (852) 2882-3939
Facsimile: (852) 2882-3331
E-mail: info@lamenviro.com
Website: <http://www.lamenviro.com>

DATE: 16 April 2019

Field Justification by Plant Specialist of the Environmental Team Regarding the Infeasibility of Transplanting the Two Mature *Aquilaria sinensis* Trees R-T02142 and R-T02157.

Background

According to the previous tree surveys and detailed vegetation survey report, the two mature *Aquilaria sinensis* trees, R-T02142 and R-T02157, were recommended for transplantation.

Transplantation proposal has proposed rootball diameter of R-T02142-(T) and R-T02157 at minimum 1500mm with a depth of 1000mm in balancing maximized root system thus post-transplantation survival against logistical practicality.

Field Justification

During a joint site visit with representatives from HK Landscape, AECOM and Lam Env. Service Ltd. on 20 March 2019, we revealed the site is full of boulders after clearance of dense ground vegetation has been carried out. Landscape Specialist Contractor has carefully dug up the top soil around core root zone, rocks/ boulders exposed in depth of a few centimetres (**Plate 1**). Due to this condition, it is impracticable to create a reasonable root ball size. Attempt has been made to remove some rocks/boulders, however, this would lead to excessive damage of the core root zone even root pruning is successful.

Vegetation clearance also revealed that there is a significant level difference at four directions of the core root zone, making a highly uneven rootball for a mature tree to be transplanted at an up straight position (**Plate 2 & 3**). R-T02157 is even growing in crevices between two large rocks (**Plate 3**).

Conclusion

Under such above-mentioned conditions and Clause 2.6 (b) of Development Bureau's Guidelines on Tree Transplanting (2014) stating "*Larger trees need bigger root ball to encompass more roots to ensure adequate re-growth, as well as anchorage and stability. Transplanting may not be recommendable for situation where a reasonable root ball size cannot be achieved...A larger root ball is recommendable for more mature trees to enhance better recovery after transplanting...Trees growing on slopes, retaining walls or areas where formation of a root ball of reasonable size is not practicable are considered not transplantable.*", root pruning would be very challenging among underground boulders; core root zone would be damaged in greater extent even root pruning is successful. Also there will be insufficient soils to form a good rootball. Post-transplantation survival rate for R-T02142-(T) and R-T02157 would then be greatly reduced. Therefore transplantation of these two trees may not be a good option upon feasibility and estimated survival rate.

Subsequently, R-T02142-(T) and R-T02157 would have to be removed due to direct conflict with currently proposed construction works.

Plate 1



Boulders exposed under top soil at the site



Boulders observed at core root zone of R-T02142-(T)



Underground rock observed near root collar of R-T02142-(T)



R-T02157 is growing between two large rocks

Plate 2.



Boulders and difference in ground level observed at 4 directions within core root zone of R-T02142-(T).

Plate 3.



Boulders and difference in ground level observed at 4 directions within core root zone of R-T02157.